

Biannual journal of the Oasis International Foundation Studium Generale Marcianum Year 7 No. 14 December 2011 Oasis is published in four editions: Italian, French/Arabic, English/Arabic, English/Urdu.

The place of prayer is dear to both Christians and Muslims as an oasis in which one meets with the Merciful God along the walk towards eternal life and with one's brothers and sisters in the bond of religion.

JOHN PAUL II

Speech at Damascus in the Omayyad Mosque, 6 May 2001





BIANNUAL JOURNAL OF THE OASIS INTERNATIONAL FOUNDATION STUDIUM GENERALE MARCIANUM

> Year 7°, Number 14, December 2011 Dorsoduro, 1, 30123 Venice, Italy Tel. +39 041 5312100 www.fondazioneoasis.org ~ oasis@marcianum.it

Editor Maria Laura Conte

Managing Editor Martino Diez

Editorial Consultants Marco Bardazzi Bernardo Cervellera Angelika Diekmann Axel Diekmann Roberto Donadoni Camille Eid Claudio Lurati Dino Pistolato

Graphic Design Anna Wawrzyniak Maoloni

Layout Anna Wawrzyniak Maoloni Alessandro Bellucci [Arabic and Urdu]

Editorial office Oasis International Foundation Tel: +39 041 5312100 www.fondazioneoasis.org E-mail: oasis@marcianum.it

Organisation Michele Brignone Chiara Pellegrino Meriem Senous

French translation Martine Gilsoul Claire Perfumo

English translation Cyprian Blamires Matthew Fforde

Arabic translation François Eid Martino Diez [from Arabic]

Urdu translation Mobeen Shahid

Registration Tribunal of Venice No.1498 of 12/10/2004 Cover price Italy €15,00 [abroad €19,00]

Distribution, circulation, subscriptions and back numbers Marcianum Press Dorsoduro 1 30123 Venice, Italy Tel. +39 041 2960608 Fax. +39 041 2419658 E-mail: abbonamenti@marcianum.it

To purchase OASIS or subscribe from abroad it is possible: to pay by credit card through the website www.marcianumpress.it

by international bank transfer to: Banca Popolare di Verona, ag. Venezia – Italia Iban IT88RØ5188Ø207ØØØØØØ1ØØ421 BIC (swift) VRBPIT2V7Ø9 Description of payment: purchase or subscription to Oasis Specify the delivery address and the chosen edition (Italian, English-Arabic, French-Arabic or English-Urdu)

Printed by Mediagraf S.p.A. Viale della Navigazione Interna, 89 35027 Noventa Padovana (Padova) Italy Tel. +39 049 8991511 Fax +39 049 8991501

PROMOTIONAL COMMITTEE:

- H.E. Card. ANGELO SCOLA, Archbishop of Milan H.B. Card. ANTONIOS NAGUIB, Coptic Patriarch of Alexandria H.E. Card. PHILIPPE BARBARIN, Archbishop of Lyons H.E. Card. JOSIP BOZANIĆ, Archbishop of Zaghreb H.E. Card. PÉTER ERDŐ, Archbishop of Budapest H.E. Card. CHRISTOPH SCHÖNBORN, Archbishop of Wien H.E. Card. JEAN-LOUIS TAURAN, President of the Pontifical Council for Interreligious Dialogue H.B. Msgr. FOUAD TWAL, Patriarch of Jerusalem of the Latins H.E. Msgr. JEAN-CLÉMENT JEANBART, Archbishop of Aleppo of the Melkites H.E. Msgr. MAROUN LAHHAM, Archbishop of Tunis H.E. Msgr. Fco. JAVIER MARTÍNEZ, Archbishop of Granada H.E. Msgr. JOHN ONAIYEKAN, Archbishop of Abuja H.E. Msgr. JOSEPH POWATHIL, Archbishop Emeritus of Changanacherry H.E. Msqr. HENRI TEISSIER, Archbishop Emeritus of Algiers H.E. Msgr. ANTHONY T. LOBO, Bishop Emeritus of Islamabad-Rawalpindi H.E. Msgr. Camillo Ballin, Apostolic Vicar of Northern Arabia H.E. Msgr. PAUL HINDER, Apostolic Vicar of Southern Arabia P. JOAQUÍN ALLIENDE, President of Aid to the Church in Need
- Prof. CARL A. ANDERSON, Supreme Knight, Knights of Columbus

Scientific Committee: TEWFIK ACLIMANDOS CARL ANDERSON GIANNI BERNARDI FRANCESCO BOTTURI RÉMI BRAGUE PAOLO BRANCA MICHELE BRIGNONE STRATFORD CALDECOTT MARIA LAURA CONTE SALIM DACCACHE MARTINO DIEZ JEAN DUCHESNE JEAN-PAUL DURAND BRIAN E. FERME FRANCESCO FOLLO JOSÉ ANDRÉS GALLEGO PAOLO GOMABASCA HENRI HUDE SAMIR KHALIL SAMIR NIKOLAUS LOBKOWICZ CESARE MIRABELLI IGNAZIO MUSU ANDREA PACINI JEAN-JACQUES PÉRENNÈS ANDREA PIN JAVIER PRADES LÓPEZ GABRIEL RICHI ALBERTI GIOVANNA ROSSI OLIVIER ROY GIOVANNI SALMERI Kamil William Samaan GUISEPPE SCATTOLIN FRANZ MAGNIS-SUSENO MILAD SIDKY ZAKHARY BOGHOS LEVON ZEKIYAN

OASIS is a transdisciplinary review of cultural information open to contributions by Catholics and non-Catholics. The authors' freely expressed opinions in the articles published herein do not necessarily reflect the doctrinal orientation of the Oasis International Foundation, and therefore must be considered as the exclusive responsibility of each contributor.

In the New that Advances, the Eternal Question

CARD. ANGELO SCOLA ARCHBISHOP OF MILAN

Where is the Middle East going? The question imposes itself and bounces back and forth unceasingly in the mass media. If we do not want only the flow of images, often confused news, or somebody's temperament, in the multiple gradations of optimism and pessimism, to determine the answer, it is very clear that a long journey awaits us, of analysis and sharing but also of witness and action. Oasis, indeed, does not want to withdraw from the demanding task of decoding the current season of change.

WORK AND FREEDOM

While the temporal distance that separates us from the first disorders in Tunisia grows, the feeling of surprise at what I have called the 'unforeseen in North Africa' does not diminish. Unforeseen not only for a majority of scholars but also, if we are not deceived, for the populations themselves who were the protagonists of the revolts, and certainly for European societies which were not rarely fixed within visions of little range. Like every unforeseen event, it contains numerous elements of disquiet, which should be emphasised with a healthy realism, but which constitute first of all an appeal that the Lord addresses to our freedom.

In the uprisings of North Africa, hitherto the subject of the economy and social rights has been of great relevance. The revolts broke out in contexts of deprivation, amongst young people, and one of the recurrent requests has been employment. The effect on European societies, which were also troubled by this crisis, was almost immediate, with a new intensification of migratory flows, accompanied by tensions. Many analysts, however, are of the opinion that the shock wave is still to come. Behind the Maghreb, indeed, press the populations of sub-Saharan Africa, who are quite often in unbearable conditions of life. A survey of the horizon which is minimally honest and realistic thus excludes the idea that we can continue with the present economic system. This is not only an ethical question, as can often be heard repeated in certain circles, above all if by ethics one means a shallow *post eventum* operation of 'maquillage'. This is, in truth, a practical

impossibility. And it is no accident that the Holy Father thought it necessary to dedicate an encyclical to drawing up a new *economic logic*. We should equally not underestimate how the physical shift of migrants will make it increasingly inevitable in Europe that we will speak about an authentic *mestizaje*. This category – and this is something which today we must acknowledge – had a certain provocative and prophetic charge, not least because it allowed the perception of the existence of a growing variety within the Islamic world, and was born, as is known, in the form of a metaphor made precise by a primary reference to 'culture and civilisation'. But demography suggests that this phenomenon could also acquire very concrete features and, as history reminds us, ones that are somewhat painful.

Together with the relevance of the economic theme, a strong request expressed itself for greater individual freedoms and a more effective control of the apparatuses of the state. This core of demands often referred to the concept of 'human dignity'. A request to reorganise the public space in a more pluralist and liberal way, capable of tolerating a higher level of internal differentiation, was advanced by some sectors of society. Some demands seem to remind us of the historical pathway taken by Europe in relation to secularity, but there are also notable differences: the question of the relations between Church and state is raised, for example, in totally new ways (hence, among other things, the idea of 'clericalising' Islam, as various European States are trying to do, could turn out to be anachronistic). Emphasis seems to be put first and foremost on the public space as a setting for a freer dialogue between different positions, within the Muslim religious field as well, while the criticism of religious conceptions in themselves which, as is known, is at the origin of by no means little confusion about secularity, does not appear to find great echo. If by the 'new secularity' we mean, as I have specified in the past, I the search for a criterion by which to regulate the space of possible coexistence, then this subject is present and relevant in the revolutions of North Africa as well, beyond the name that will be used. And perhaps the emphasis on the openness of the public space makes the term 'civism', madaniyya, the most suitable. Whatever the case, the terminological question is not the first urgency: there comes to mind the invitation of Husserl to return to 'things themselves'.

It is also for this reason that to lay stress, instead, on 'secularity', transforming it from a European historical experience (which has been variously interpreted and not without contradictions) into an absolute category of the spirit whose manifestation (finally) is awaited in non-European civilisations as well, does not seem to be a particularly promising or effective pathway at a cognitive level. It should not be forgotten, in fact, that the self-portrayal of a number of states of the Middle East as 'journeying towards secularity', together with a rhetoric of reforms, has often been used to mask authoritarian drifts. Paradoxically, the facts of North Africa demonstrate, in addition to a thousand other things, that the stress placed upon the need for a new secularity or upon positive secularity (to which Benedict XVI has dedicated more than one address) is not a verbal stratagem thought up by some people in order to avoid speaking about secularity *tout court*, but a need imposed by the facts.

ANGELO SCOLA, Una nuova laicità. Temi per una società plurale (Marsilio, Venice, 2007), pp. 15-45.

REVOLTS OR REVOLUTIONS?

The two ingredients that I have referred to, namely economic demands and the request for greater individual rights, led to a concatenation of revolts which we cannot as yet say has ended. Are they also revolutions? Augusto del Noce, the great Italian philosopher of the second part of the twentieth century, in his *Il problema dell'ateismo* ('The Problem of Atheism') has an illuminating observation here, even though it was made in a context different from ours, namely in the contrast between the Marxist revolution and the surrealist revolt: 'The moment of pure revolt dissociates itself from the idea of revolution, because to the latter is essential the idea of truth'. The movements of North Africa were born as revolts of an economic character. If they became – at least for some sections of their respective societies – revolutions, this is because they brought into play a certain idea of man. If they want to continue to be revolutions, it is this very idea that they must explore.

In the Middle East the question about what kind of man the man of the third millennium wants to be has rung out forcefully. This is the same question which in different forms is increasingly powerfully shaking Western societies. In reality, however, although the question is clear, the answer is not yet well defined. Let us think for example of what would happen if the economic situation of Tunisia and Egypt continued to be very negative: the need for order and stability would absolutely come to the fore to the disadvantage of the discourse of freedoms. Furthermore, although in Egypt the oppositions between communities, or oppositions presented as such, caused an increasing number of victims, until the unacceptable incidents of the autumn, countries with a very marked internal variety such as Syria have been openly experiencing the climate of a civil war. The protest movements are not exempted from the risk of being exploited by fundamentalists or demagogues and probably not everything was born so innocently as some of the mass media would have us believe. Lastly, we cannot forget that in other parts of the world with Muslim majorities (I am thinking here of Pakistan but also of the martyred Iraq), things seem to be moving in a totally different direction. The spaces of freedom, just as they open can also close and we must distinguish between long-term prospects and immediate consequences. It would really be a sad paradox (to avoid which the international community must act in every way possible) if revolts carried out in the name of freedom ended up with the cancellation of those concrete experiences of positively adopted pluralism the eastern Christian communities.

Despite everything, these phenomena of insurrection constitute a point of noreturn, a watershed that is certainly more marked compared to the European 1989 and the recent movements of the 'indignant'. The new media have played a role in this change, albeit a role that has often been exaggerated, whereas the influence of finance and the army has been generally underestimated. However, the central aspect remains the pluralisation of society induced by the insurrections; it is very important that this phenomenon is addressed respecting the pathway of each party, but the phenomenon exists. In a context of greater differentiation it will be necessary to find suitable reasons for a more secure foundation for personal freedom,

 AUGUSTO DEL NOCE, Il problema dell'ateismo (Il Mulino, Bologna, 2010, first edition 1964), p. 100. and here religious freedom appears to be the litmus test, given that the invoked dignity of the person finds in it its ultimate foundation: otherwise it would run the risk of being reduced to a *flatus vocis*, a mere verbal expression. Not necessarily contradictory in relation to such a need, and indeed comprehensible as regards its motivations, is the emphasis on the rights of the individual. However, the experience of the West has demonstrated that by this route one can also arrive at a tragedy. A crisis of education and of generation, an identity that does not want to have connections: this is the fatal illness of our society. Here we have the warning that should come from the West.

The question from which we began takes on, therefore, a new and more incisive formulation: not so much *where is the Middle East going* but the *Middle East through whom*? The answer, in fact, will be played out first and foremost at the level of subjects who will lead the change.

THE PRACTICAL GOOD OF BEING-TOGETHER

If the idea of man will determine the form that the demand for pluralism will take in the Middle East, to the point of the possibility of its tragic overturning, which proposal is able to advance the Christian faith? Does it have something specific to say? In attempting to answer this question, I inevitably shift the centre of our attention from the reality of the Middle East to the context of plural European societies which, indeed, is specific to me. Whether these reflections can also be applied elsewhere (to a certain extent I believe that this is the case) is one of the impassioned reasons why Oasis exists.

Benedict XVI, during his recent visit to Aquileia and Venice in may 2011, had occasion to state, echoing the words of the ancient *Letter to Diognetus*: 'Do not deny anything of the Gospel in which you believe, but live in the midst of others with sympathy, communicating by your very way of life that humanism which is rooted in Christianity, in order to build together with all people of good will a "city" which is more human, more just and more supportive'. After the *drama of atheistic humanism* (De Lubac), the Holy Father thus exhorts us to rediscover a Christian humanism in which finds space, as its intrinsic and not seasonal dimension (once again the words of Benedict XVI), openness to other religions and to men of good will. This is a major challenge which still awaits to be suitably addressed and which embraces various aspects, from the theological, anthropological and cultural dimensions to the more strictly political dimension, to which I intend to confine myself.

 BENEDICT XVI, 'Address to the Assembly of the Second Meeting of Aquileia', Basilica of Aquileia, 7 May 2011.

4 Cf. Jacques Maritain, 'Les possibilités de coopération dans un monde divisé' in *Œuvres 1940-1963* (Desclée de Brouwer, Paris, 1979), pp. 435-450. And specifically at the strictly political level, in some past works I have stressed, in order to identify the criterion for possible coexistence in a plural society, the political-practical value of being-together. In this way my exhortation was to recognise that, if as Christians we truly believe in a Father who guides history while awaiting us in His home ('the tent of God with men' of Ap 21:3), we cannot consider as extraneous to His design the condition of unprecedented plurality that we are experiencing nowadays. I am still convinced that this simple observation has enormous practical and psychological consequences and already allows us to see in a completely different way the problem of migrants in the West, or, in the East, the meaning of a minority Christian presence.

LEADING ARTICLE

However, some dialogues and contributions **5** have led me to consider the possibility that this principle, founded on the recognition of being in society as a political good, can be adopted as a sufficient criterion to underpin in a suitable way a public space in a context of unprecedented plurality (not, that is to say, a context in which, as has been the case hitherto with Europe, some tacitly admitted Christian ethical assumption have acted to contain possible conflicts). 6 The principle of being together, or if one prefers of communication between subjects, although open to different speculative or doctrinal underpinnings, brings with it certain contents at the level of values. I Indeed, it excludes conceptions of a terroristic or separatist character because they contradict the criterion of political communication; it pre-supposes the freedom of participation, demands equality and places justice as conditions of realisation. It admits variations in realisations but within a certain limit. The eastern bishops have reflected a great deal on the notion of 'conviviality', most recently at the Special Assembly of the synod of Bishops for the Middle East. Could the political analysis that I have here just touched upon be understood as an examination of this practical experience, which amidst so many difficulties and persecutions has never ceased to be present?

We should certainly examine with great attention the question of whether the 'communicative' principle of being-together in itself is sufficient to avoid relativistic negative tendencies. Whatever the case, men of religion should place in their narration aiming at mutual recognition between the actors that inhabit plural society a consideration of the dignity of the human person created in 'the image and likeness of God' (cf. Gen 1:27) or the 'vice-regent of God on earth' (Qur'an 2:30). This at least seems to be the opinion of St. Augustine who, paraphrasing in a brilliant way that gospel principle 'Render unto Caesar that which is Caesar's, and unto God that which is God's' (Mt 22:21; cf. Mk 12:17 and Lk 20:25), adds: 'Render unto Caesar his monetary image and unto God the human person, created in His image'. One the other hand one could reply that 'the intrinsic and irreducible dignity of the human subject is to be found with more certainty and pertinence within his historical-social action as his condition of possibility's because the act of communication implies the encounter of free and personal subjects.

In handing over to everyone the task of exploring the good reasons for a life in common, without which the tribulations of Euro-Atlantic and North African societies will remain exposed to every type of negative tendency, it seems to me to be necessary to remember, as we have done on so many other occasions, the ineluctable horizon of the work that awaits us. It can only involve witness.

Over these years, thanks to Oasis, we have had the good fortune to encounter a number of extraordinary figures. I would like to cite just two: H.E. Msgr. Luigi Padovese, who was tragically murdered in Turkey, and the Pakistani minister, Shahbaz Bhatti, that great champion, together with the Muslim governor of the Punjab, Salmaan Taseer, of the fight against the unjust law on blasphemy. May their example stimulate Christians and all men of good will to not step back in the construction of a good personal and communitarian life! This is our historic task. We owe it to ourselves and somewhat to them as well.

- Cf. FRANCESCO BOTTURI, 'Pluralismo sociale e virtù politica', Hermeneutica 1 (2002), 1-33, and more recently my Buone ragioni per la vita in comune (Mondadori, Milan, 2010), pp. 11-14.
- 6 On this 'disloyalty of modern times' cf. ROMANO GUARDINI, The End of the Modern World, (Sheed & Ward, Lanham MD, 1957).
- Historically this thesis found a great defender in the figure of the Spanish Dominican Francisco de Vitoria, the theoriser of 'natural communication': cf. P. GOMARASCA, Meticciato, convivenza o confusione? (Marcianum Press, Venice, 2009), pp. 73-78. The whole of the subject of relational reason. developed by PIERPAOLO DONATI in particular in the volume Oltre il multiculturalismo (Laterza, Rome-Bari, 2008), appreciates the communicative dimension as a possible solution to intercultural conflicts.
- 8 AUGUSTINE, Exposition on Psalm 94, 2.

 FRANCESCO BOTTURI,
'Secolarizzazione e laicità', in P. Donati (ed.), Laicità: la ricerca dell'universale nelle differenze (II Mulino, Bologna, 2008), pp. 295-337.

FOCUS

Of all the definitions that have been tried to describe the events that have taken place in North Africa and the Middle East since the beginning of 2011, the most fitting seems to be 'fugitive spring', a tandem that expresses at one and the same time the hope for change and the fragility that the Arab revolts involve. To enter this fleeting dimension means to explore the real protagonists, who at times have remained in the shadows of the movements of the streets, to explore who now intends to gather the fruits of the audacious action of the demonstrators and to govern these states and how this will be done. These states have to address within them – in the context of the international economic crisis – an explosive demand for freedom. It is also means to explore what slogans have been shouted in those streets and how the key words of political and electoral debates such as democracy, participation, rights and, above all, secularity, strike the ear. Secularity is a category as determining as it is variously interpreted and misunderstood in societies which have to deal with a pluralism that came into being with revolutions and govern it. Without forgetting that what is happening along the southern shores of the Mediterranean sea also influences the countries of the whole of the Euro-Atlantic area. 12

Good Government, the Individual and Freedom of Faith	Olivier Roy	13
Islamism and Secularity: the Useful Ambiguity	Malika Zeghal	18
on the Crest of Tahrir Square	H.B. Card. Antonios Naguib	24
Mubarak and the Army: Divorce Egyptian Style	Tewfik Aclimandos	28
Religion at the Service of the King	Madawi Al-Rasheed	36
an Uncertain and Painful Turning Point	Moncef Djaziri	44
if Arab 'Malaise' Shakes Europe and America	Vittorio Emanuele Parsi	50
the Price of the Ottoman Failure	Mark L. Movsesian	55
the Hard Work of the Secular Building Site	Hoda Nehmé	60
the Old is Inadequate, the New is Frightening	Dominique Avon	64
Different, but Together. Towards a New Citizenship	SALIM DACCACHE S.J.	71
Beyond the Wall Between Church and State	John Witte Jr ~ Justin Latterell	73
Unpacking the Secular Bundle	Jennifer Marshall	79

DOCUMENTS The address of Benedict XVI to the Bundestag in Berlin during his apostolic journey in Germany last September offered a new background to the subject of the relationship between Christian faith and civil life, in particular as regards the idea of law. A text that documents how the foundation of public ethics is written by God into the creation which in itself is accessible to everyone. A sort of constructed bridge which fosters reflection on how, and beginning with which pre-suppositions, men of different religions can make a good contribution to life in common in plural societies, as can be read in the address to the representatives of the German Muslim community. Concern about the public dimension of religion also animates *Arab Political Logic* by Muhammad 'Abid al-Jabri, who is very clear in declaring that a theory of the Islamic State has never existed and who is acute both in unmasking the myths and ideologies that have marked the development of Muslim political thought and in describing the need for a critique of them.

a Human Ecology also Exists	H.H. Benedict XVI	86
Men of Religion Together for the Good Lives of Everyone	H.H. Benedict XVI	90
the Task of Critique or the Return of the Repressed	Muhammad 'Abid al-Jabri	93



MEETINGS

To go through everything, including every page of history and every historical actor, to obtain everything that can contribute to an analysis – such is the ability of Antoine Messarra, a member of the Lebanese Constitutional Council, who, beginning with his long human and professional experience, interprets what is taking place in the Middle East and North Africa without partisanship or dissimulations, even though he is personally involved. To the point of outlining in a clear way that authoritarian regimes, which have at times been held to be the only ones that are able to defend certain minorities, in reality protect nobody at all, neither Christians nor Muslims, and affirming with conviction that a future for Arab countries will only be possible if that future is founded on law. 96

"THE POWER OF A STATE? ITS LEGITIMACY" INTERVIEW WITH ANTOINE MESSARRA MARTINO DIEZ

97

REVIEWS In the books of this issue: the philosophical debate on secularity; ten lessons on the Arab revolutions; a photograph of Egyptian society on the point of exploding; the portrayal of Mary in Islamic art; the history of Dervishes in Istanbul in the seventeenth century. And lastly, to end this section, news from Iranian cinema and the new imagination of Italian directors. 104

Fragmented, not Eclipsed, Religion	Paolo Monti	105
Democracy or Chaos	Michele Brignone	106
FROM NASSER TO MUBARAK: A COUNTRY X-RAYED	Chiara Pellegrino	107
Mary: the Woman of Majesty and Beauty	Martino Diez	108
IN DEFENCE OF A TRADITION	Catherine Pinguet	109
Fearless Cameras and Inattentive Films	Emma Neri	110

A R T

How burning is people's wish to see the Face of God? History documents that all religions have sought the impossible – to fix mystery in images. Mohammed Ali Amir-Moezzi explores an aspect of Islamic tradition that has hitherto been totally ignored by scholarly research – the use of devotional icons in Shi'ite mysticism. In parallel fashion, Agnès-Mariam de la Croix, the igumen of the convent of St. James the Intercised in Syria, examines the mosaics of the Christian, Jewish and Muslim traditions, and shows the constant tension in them between a wish to portray God and the need to respect His transcendence. To the point of the irruption of Jesus Christ, in whom 'the whole of the fullness of divinity dwells corporally'.

Devotion and Contemplation. the Icon in Shi'ite Islam	Mohammad Ali Amir-Moezzi	112
the Form Disappears to Make Way for the Chosen One	Agnès-Mariam de la Croix	120

